COZEN O'CC 123 NORTH WACK SUITE 180 CHICAGO, ILLINOK

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

24

25

26

27

3. SONESTA received the complaint on November 29, 2022 and the removal, which is occurring within 30 days of SONESTA's receipt of the complaint, is therefore timely under 28. U.S.C. § 1446(b)(1).

Complete Diversity Exists

- 4. At all times relevant, PLAINTIFF was a resident of Maricopa County, Arizona. Ex. A, ¶ 3.
- 5. At all times relevant, SONESTA was a citizen of Maryland, with its principal place of business in Newton, Massachusetts. *See* Declaration of Gary Gassman, attached as Exhibit B.
- 6. The underlying lawsuit is between a plaintiff-citizen of Arizona and a defendant-citizen of Maryland and Massachusetts and therefore, complete diversity exists between the parties pursuant to 28. U.S.C. § 1332(a)(1).

Amount in Controversy

- 7. 28 U.S.C. § 1446(c)(2)(A)(ii) permits a defendant to assert the amount in controversy where the amount is not stated in the state court pleading.
- 8. PLAINTIFF'S complaint alleges that the actions is claiming more than 50,000 and less than 300,000 in damages. Ex. A, \P 2.
- 9. PLAINTIFF seeks an award of medical and related expenses incurred to date and future medical expenses; reasonable value of mileage expense; reasonable value of PLAINTIFF'S current and future loss of income and earning capacity; past and future loss of earnings; and costs and expenses incurred in bringing the action. Exhibit A.
- 10. The district court determines whether defendant has met this burden by first considering whether it is "facially apparent" from the complaint that the jurisdictional amount has been satisfied. *Singer v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.*, 116 F.3d 373, 377 (9th Cir.1997). If the complaint does not clearly specify damages, the court may examine facts in the complaint and evidence submitted by the parties. *Matheson v. Progressive Specialty*

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Ins. Co., 319 F.3d 1089, 1091 (9th Cir. 2003). A settlement letter may provide a reasonable estimate of plaintiff's claim. See Cohn v. Petsmart, Inc., 281 F.3d 837, 840 (9th Cir. 2002) (a settlement letter is relevant evidence of the amount in controversy if it reflects a reasonable estimate of the plaintiff's claim). Prior to filing suit, Plaintiff made a settlement demand in excess of \$75,000 to resolve her claims against SONESTA. Exhibit B.

11. Therefore, the amount in controversy exceeds \$75,000 and satisfies 28 U.S.C. § 1332(a)(1).

Notice to Plaintiff and State Court

- 12. A Notice of Filing of this Notice of Removal will be filed with the Superior Court of Coconino County, Arizona contemporaneously with the filing of this Notice of Removal in accordance with 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b), and written notice of the filing of this 12 Notice of Removal will be served upon PLAINTIFF'S counsel. A copy of the Notice of Filing of Notice of Removal is attached as Exhibit C.
 - SONESTA demands a trial by jury on all issues triable by jury. 13.

WHEREFORE, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1332(a), 1441(a) and 1446, Defendant, SONESTA INTERNATIONAL HOTELS CORPORATION, removes this case to the United States District Court for the District of Arizona, for all further proceedings in this matter.

Dated: December 19, 2022 Respectfully submitted, /s/ Julie L. Trester Julie L. Trester, Esquire, 013107 (itrester@cozen.com) Gary L. Gassman, Esquire, SBN 032271 (ggassman@cozen.com) 123 North Wacker Drive, Suite 1800 Chicago, IL 60606 Telephone: 312-474-7900 Fax: 312-706-9708 Attorneys for Defendant Sonesta International Hotels Corporation

COZEN O CONNOR 123 NORTH WACKER DRIVE SUITE 1800 CHICAGO, ILLINOIS 60606

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Julie L. Trester, hereby certify that on December 20, 2022, I filed Defendant SONESTA INTERNTIONAL HOTEL COPRORATION's Notice of Removal with the United States District Court for the District of Arizona using the Court's ECF filing system and that all counsel of record be served via certified and electronic mail.

/s/ Julie L. Trester

Julie L. Trester
Gary L. Gassman
123 North Wacker Drive, Suite 1800
Chicago, IL 60606
jtrester@cozen.com
ggassman@cozen.com
Attorney for Defendant
Sonesta International Hotel Corporation



Notice of Service of Process

null / ALL er: 25977765

Transmittal Number: 25977765 Date Processed: 12/01/2022

Primary Contact: Jennifer Clark

The RMR Group LLC 255 Washington St

Ste 300

Newton, MA 02458-1634

Electronic copy provided to: Camille Balletto

Entity: Sonesta International Hotels Corporation

Entity ID Number 3081376

Entity Served: Sonesta International Hotels Corporation, dba Sonesta Es Suites

Title of Action: Donna A McDuff vs. Sonesta International Hotels Corporation, dba Sonesta Es

Suites

Matter Name/ID: Donna A McDuff vs. Sonesta International Hotels Corporation, dba Sonesta Es

Suites (13278890)

Document(s) Type: Summons/Complaint

Nature of Action: Personal Injury

Court/Agency: Coconino County Superior Court, AZ

Case/Reference No: S0300CV202200545

Jurisdiction Served:

Date Served on CSC:

Answer or Appearance Due:

Originally Served On:

Arizona

11/29/2022

20 Days

CSC

How Served: Personal Service
Sender Information: Goldberg & Osborne 602-808-6300

Information contained on this transmittal form is for record keeping, notification and forwarding the attached document(s). It does not constitute a legal opinion. The recipient is responsible for interpreting the documents and taking appropriate action.

To avoid potential delay, please do not send your response to CSC

251 Little Falls Drive, Wilmington, Delaware 19808-1674 (888) 690-2882 | sop@cscglobal.com

Person/Attorney Filing: Amanda L Boardman Mailing Address: 698 E Wetmore Rd Ste 200 City, State, Zip Code: Tucson, AZ 85705 Phone Number: (602)808-6331X6331

E-Mail Address: aboardman@goldbergandosborne.com

[] Representing Self, Without an Attorney

(If Attorney) State Bar Number: 030061, Issuing State: AZ

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF COCONINO

Donna A McDuff Plaintiff(s),

Case No. | S0300CV202200545

٧.

Sonesta International Hotels

SUMMONS

Corporation, DBA Sonesta Es Suites Defendant(s).

To: Sonesta International Hotels Corporation, DBA Sonesta Es Suites

WARNING: THIS AN OFFICIAL DOCUMENT FROM THE COURT THAT AFFECTS YOUR RIGHTS. READ THIS SUMMONS CAREFULLY. IF YOU DO NOT UNDERSTAND IT, CONTACT AN ATTORNEY FOR LEGAL ADVICE.

- 1. A lawsuit has been filed against you. A copy of the lawsuit and other court papers were served on you with this Summons.
- 2. If you do not want a judgment taken against you without your input, you must file an Answer in writing with the Court, and you must pay the required filing fee. To file your Answer, take or send the papers to Clerk of the Superior Court, 200 N. San Francisco St., Flagstaff, Arizona 86001 or electronically file your Answer through one of Arizona's approved electronic filing systems at http://www.azcourts.gov/efilinginformation.

 Mail a copy of the Answer to the other party, the Plaintiff, at the address listed on the top of this Summons.

Note: If you do not file electronically you will not have electronic access to the documents in this case.

3. If this Summons and the other court papers were served on you within the State of Arizona, your Answer must be filed within TWENTY (20) CALENDAR DAYS from the date of service, not counting the day of service. If this Summons and the other court papers were served on you outside the State of Arizona, your Answer must be filed within THIRTY (30) CALENDAR DAYS from the date of service, not counting the day of service.

Requests for reasonable accommodation for persons with disabilities must be made to the court by parties at least 3 working days in advance of a scheduled court proceeding.

GIVEN under my hand and the Seal of the Superior Court of the State of Arizona in and for the County of COCONINO

SIGNED AND SEALED this date: November 9, 2022

Valerie Wyant Clerk of Superior Court

By:LECLARK
Deputy Clerk



Valerie Wyant CLERK, SUPERIOR COURT 11/09/2022 11:23AM BY: LECLARK DEPUTY 1 **GOLDBERG & OSBORNE** Case No.: S0300CV202200545 2815 S. Alma School Rd., #122 HON. TED REED 2 Mesa, Arizona 85210 3 Phone: (602) 808-6300 Amanda L. Boardman #030061 4 aboardman@1800theeagle.com Attorney for Plaintiff 5 6 IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA 7 IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF COCONINO 8 DONNA A. MCDUFF, an individual, NO: 9 10 Plaintiff, **COMPLAINT** VS. 11 (Premises Liability) 12 SONESTA INTERNATIONAL HOTELS CORPORATION, a Maryland corporation 13 dba SONESTA ES SUITES; JOHN DOE TIER II 14 AND JANE DOE EMPLOYEE; JOHN DOES I-V; JANE DOES I-V, fictitious 15 individuals; ABC CORPORATIONS and/or 16 PARTNERSHIPS and/or SOLE PROPRIETORSHIPS and/or JOINT 17 VENTURES, I-X; fictitious entities. 18 Defendants. 19 20 Plaintiff, DONNA A. MCDUFF, by and through counsel undersigned, for her 21 Complaint, alleges as follows: 22 Venue and jurisdiction are proper in Coconino County, Arizona. 1. 23 24 Discovery Tier: Pursuant to Arizona Rules of Civil Procedure, Rule 26.2(c)(3) the 25 Court should assign this case to the following tier based on the amount of damages 26 requested. 27 28 Tier 1 = Actions claiming \$50,000.00 or less in damages.-1-

Case 3:22-cv-08236-ESW Document 1 Filed 12/21/22 Page 8 of 23

- Tier 2 = Actions claiming more than \$50,000.00 and less than \$300,000.00 in damages, or actions claiming non-monetary relief.

 Tier 3 = Actions claiming \$300,000.00 or more in damages.
- 3. Plaintiff Donna A. McDuff is a resident of Maricopa County, Arizona.
- 4. Upon information and belief, Defendant Sonesta International Hotels Corporation is a Maryland corporation doing business as Sonesta ES Suites and is authorized to do and is doing business in the State of Arizona and caused an event to occur in Arizona that is the subject of Plaintiff's Complaint herein.
- 5. Upon information and belief, Defendant Sonesta International Hotels Corporation is in the business of owning and operating hotels.
- 6. Upon information and belief, JOHN DOE EMPLOYEE and JANE DOE EMPLOYEE, were a married couple at all times relevant hereto and residents of Coconino County, Arizona. The true identity of JOHN DOE EMPLOYEE and JANE DOE EMPLOYEE are presently unknown to Plaintiff, and Plaintiff will seek leave to amend her Complaint when their true identities are ascertained. Upon information and belief, at all times alleged herein, Defendant JOHN DOE EMPLOYEE was acting individually and on behalf of any furtherance of his marital community with JANE DOE EMPLOYEE.
- 7. Upon information and belief, Plaintiff alleges that at the time of the events set forth in this Complaint, Defendants JOHN DOE EMPLOYEE and JANE DOE EMPLOYEE were employees, servants and/or agents of Defendant Sonesta International Hotels Corporation and was acting within the course and scope of employment or under their

direction and control, or under such circumstances as to justify imputing responsibility for the careless and/or negligent and/or reckless acts complained of herein to Defendants under the principles of respondent superior.

- 8. All acts complained of herein occurred in furtherance of the Defendants' marital community. Defendants JOHN and JANE DOES I through V, ABC CORPORATIONS I-X and/or PARTNERSHIPS I-X are corporations, business entities, persons, agents servants or employees whose true names are not now known to Plaintiff. To the extent of discovery to be conducted, Plaintiff alleges that JOHN and JANE DOES I through V, ABC CORPORATIONS I-X and/or PARTNERSHIPS I-X are residents of the County of Coconino, State of Arizona and they caused events to occur in the State of Arizona out of which Plaintiff's cause of action arose. Plaintiff requests leave of Court to amend the Complaint once the true identities of these Defendants become known to Plaintiff.
- 9. The Plaintiff is informed, believes and thereupon alleges that the Defendants designated as Does I-V and/or ABC CORPORATIONS I-X and/or PARTNERSHIPS I-X, inclusive, are anyone of the following:
 - a. Parties responsible in some manner for the events and happenings herein referred to that caused injuries and damages proximately thereby to the Plaintiff as herein alleged.
 - b. Parties that are the agents, servants, employees and/or contractors of the Defendants, each of them acting within the course and scope of their agency, employment or contract.

c.	Part	ies that	own,	, lea	se, r	nanage, op	erate	e, seci	ure, ins	pect, repa	ir, mainta	ain
and/or	are	respons	sible	for	the	Defendant	s ve	hicle	and/or	business	referred	to
hereina	after;	or										

- d. Parties that have assumed or retained liabilities if any of the Defendants by virtue of agreement, sale, transfer or otherwise.
- 10. The corporate Defendants, if any, are believed to be authorized, and are doing business in Arizona.
- 11. The amount of controversy satisfies the jurisdiction requirements of the Superior Court.

GENERAL ALLEGATIONS

- 12. Plaintiff re-alleges each and every allegation contained in paragraphs 1 through 11 above as though fully set forth herein.
- 13. Upon information and belief, Defendant Sonesta International Hotels Corporation (hereinafter "Sonesta ES Suites) is the owner of the real property located at 1400 North Country Club Drive, Flagstaff, Arizona 86004 more commonly known, and doing business as Sonesta ES Suites.
- 14. On November 13, 2020, Plaintiff was a business invitee at Sonesta ES Suites.
- 15. On said date, Plaintiff was walking from the hotel room to her vehicle when she tripped and fell on the outdoor concrete slab walkway. As a result, Plaintiff sustained serious personal injuries.

27 | | ///

28 ||

1 **COUNT I – NEGLIGENCE** 2 16. Plaintiff re-alleges each and every allegation contained in paragraphs 1 through 15 3 as though fully set forth herein. 4 5 17. The trip and fall occurred in a common area owned, controlled, managed, and 6 maintained by the Defendants. 7 The Defendants were responsible for the premises, including, without limitation, 18. 8 the maintenance and upkeep of the premises. 9 10 19. At the time of the incident, Defendant JOHN DOE AND JANE EMPLOYEE was 11 acting in the course and scope of his employment with Defendants. 12 20. Defendants are legally responsible for the acts of Defendant JOHN DOE AND 13 14 JANE DOE EMPLOYEE under the doctrine of respondeat superior. 15 21. Defendants negligently performed their duties, including, but not limited to failing 16 to repair and/or maintain their walkways for an unreasonably long period of time. 17 18 The incident was caused by the negligent and careless manner in which the 22. 19 Defendants failed to maintain the premises, failed to warn the Plaintiff of the unreasonably 20 dangerous condition, failed to inspect the premises for unreasonably dangerous conditions, 21 22 and failed to take reasonable measures to protect the Plaintiff from the dangerous condition. 24 The premises and/or area were defective and unreasonably dangerous at the time of 23. 25

27 28

set forth herein.

26

23

Plaintiff's trip and fall and the defective premises and/or area caused Plaintiff the injuries

5

11 12

13

14 15

16 17

18

19

20

21

22 23

25

26

24

27

28

24. The Defendants, in whole or part, were in control and legally responsible for the premises, including and without limitation, the area where Plaintiff's fall occurred and were responsible for the dangerous condition present on the premises.

COUNT II – PREMISES LIABILITY

- 25. Plaintiff re-alleges each and every allegation contained in paragraphs 1 through 24 as though fully set forth herein.
- The Defendants knew or should have known of the unreasonably dangerous 26. condition of the walkway.
- 27. Defendants are charged with notice by virtue of that agency.
- 28. Defendants failed to repair the unsafe sidewalk, failed to maintain the premises, failed to warn the Plaintiff of the unreasonably dangerous condition, failed to inspect the premises for unreasonably dangerous conditions, and failed to take reasonable measures to protect the Plaintiff and its business invitees.
- 29. Defendants are liable for Plaintiff's injuries occurring as a result of Plaintiff's trip and fall on the defective walkway on their premises.

COUNT III - DAMAGES

- 30. Plaintiff re-alleges each and every allegation contained in paragraphs 1 through 29 as though fully set forth herein.
- 31. As a direct and proximate result of the wrongful acts of Defendants, Plaintiff sustained injuries which have resulted in considerable pain, suffering, inconvenience, permanent scarring, functional impairment, disfigurement, emotional distress, and loss of enjoyment of life, loss of income, and may cause future pain and suffering.

	Case 3:22-cv-08236-ESW Document 1 Filed 12/21/22 Page 15 of 23
1	DATED this 9 th day of November, 2022.
2	GOLDBERG & OSBORNE
3	/s/ Amanda Boardman
5	Amanda L. Boardman, Esq.
6	Attorney for Plaintiff
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14 15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23 24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
i	1

FILED
Valerie Wyant
CLERK, SUPERIOR COURT
11/09/2022 11:23AM
BY: LECLARK
DEPUTY

Case No.: S0300CV202200545 HON. TED REED

Person/Attorney Filing: Amanda L Boardman Mailing Address: 698 E Wetmore Rd Ste 200 City, State, Zip Code: Tucson, AZ 85705

Phone Number: (602)808-6331X6331

E-Mail Address: aboardman@goldbergandosborne.com

[] Representing Self, Without an Attorney

(If Attorney) State Bar Number: 030061, Issuing State: AZ

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF COCONINO

Donna A McDuff Plaintiff(s),

Case No.

v.

Sonesta International Hotels Corporation, DBA Sonesta Es Suites Defendant(s).

CERTIFICATE OF COMPULSORY ARBITRATION

I certify that I am aware of the dollar limits and any other limitations set forth by the Local Rules of Practice for the Coconino County Superior Court, and I further certify that this case IS NOT subject to compulsory arbitration, as provided by Rules 72 through 77 of the Arizona Rules of Civil Procedure.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this

By: Amanda L Boardman /s/ Plaintiff/Attorney for Plaintiff

	3.	Attached as Exhibit "1" to this Declaration is a true and accurate copy of a
print-o	ut fron	the Secretary of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts related to SONESTA'S
corpora	ate citi	zenship.

4. Prior to filing suit, Plaintiff, DONNA A. MCDUFF made a demand in excess of \$75,000 to settle her claims against SONESTA which are the basis of her lawsuit.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on December 19, 2022.

/s/ Gary L. Gassman

Gary L. Gassman, Esquire, SBN 032271 (ggassman@cozen.com)
123 North Wacker Drive, Suite 1800

Chicago, IL 60606

Telephone: 312-474.7900

Fax: 312-706-9708

One of the Attorneys for Defendant

Sonesta International Hotels Corporation

12/19/22, 11:07 AM

Corporations Division

Business Entity Summary

ID Number: 001064628 Request certificate New search

Summary for: SONESTA INTERNATIONAL HOTELS CORPORATION

The exact name of the Foreign Corporation: SONESTA INTERNATIONAL HOTELS

CORPORATION

The name was changed from: SONESTA ACQUISITION CORP. on 02-22-2012

Entity type: Foreign Corporation

Date of Registration in Massachusetts:

11-07-2011

Last date certain:

Organized under the laws of: State: MD Country: USA on: 10-31-2011

Current Fiscal Month/Day: 09/30 Previous Fiscal Month/Day: 09/30

The location of the Principal Office:

Address: 400 CENTRE STREET

City or town, State, Zip code, NEWTON, MA 02458 USA

Country:

The location of the Massachusetts office, if any:

Address:

City or town, State, Zip code,

Country:

The name and address of the Registered Agent:

Name: CORPORATION SERVICE COMPANY

Address: 84 STATE ST.

City or town, State, Zip code, BOSTON, MA 02109 USA

Country:

The Officers and Directors of the Corporation:

Title	Individual Name	Address
PRESIDENT	JOHN G MURRAY	TWO NEWTON PLACE, 255 WASHINGTON STREET NEWTON, MA 02458 USA
TREASURER	STEPHEN P MIANO	400 CENTRE STREET NEWTON, MA 02458 USA
SECRETARY	JENNIFER B CLARK	400 CENTRE STREET NEWTON, MA 02458 USA
VICE PRESIDENT	BRADFORD P MAXWELL	400 CENTRE STREET NEWTON, MA 02458 USA
VICE PRESIDENT	KEITH J PIERCE	400 CENTRE STREET NEWTON, MA 02458 USA

12/19/22, 11:07 AM Case 3:22-cv-08236-ESW Doownoontofation File child light and Page 20 of 23

VICE PRESIDENT	VERA N MANOUKIAN	400 C USA	ENTRE STREE	T NEWTON, MA 02458			
DIRECTOR	ADAM D PORTNOY	400 C USA	400 CENTRE STREET NEWTON, MA 02458 USA				
DIRECTOR	JENNIFER B CLARK	400 C USA	400 CENTRE STREET NEWTON, MA 02458 USA				
DIRECTOR	JOHN G MURRAY		TWO NEWTON PLACE, 255 WASHINGTON STREET NEWTON, MA 02458 USA				
Business entity s	stock is publicly tra	ded:					
	r of shares and the ity is authorized to		of each clas	s of stock which			
Class of Stock	Dou volvo non oboro	Total Aut	horized	Total issued and outstanding			
Class of Stock	Par value per share	No. of shares	Total par value	No. of shares			
	-						
	Consent Data	fidential M Allo	erger wed	Manufacturing			
View filings for t	his business entity:	•					
ALL FILINGS Amended Foreign Annual Report Annual Report - F Application for Re		cate		•			
		View filings					
Co	omments or notes a	ssociated with th	nis business	entity:			
				//			

New search

COZEN O'CONNOR 123 NORTH WACKER DRIVE SUITE 1800 CHICAGO, ILLINOIS 60606

LEGAL\60787592\1

EXHIBIT C

	Case 3	3:22-cv-08236-ESW	Document 1	Filed 12/21/22 Page 22 of 23	
1	DATED:	December 20, 2022	CC	OZEN O'CONNOR	
2					
3			Ву	: <u>Julie L. Trester</u> Julie L. Trester, Esq., 013107	
4				Gary L. Gassman, Esq., SBN 032271	
5				Attorney for Sonesta International H Corporation	otels
6				1	
7					
8					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
2425					
26					
27					
28					
				2	

COZEN O'CONNOR 123 NORTH WACKER DRIVE SUITE 1800 CHICAGO, ILLINOIS 60606

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Julie L. Trester, hereby certify that on December 20, 2022, I caused to be served a true a nd correct copy of the foregoing Notice of Filing Notice of Removal upon the following counsel vi a email, with a copy also sent via regular US Mail:

Amanda L. Boardman Goldberg & Osborne 2815 S. Alma School Rd, #122 Mesa, Arizona 85210 aboardman@1800eagle.com

By: <u>Julie L. Trester</u> Julie L. Trester, Esq., 013107 Gary L. Gassman, Esq., SBN 032271

Attorney for Sonesta International Hotels Corporation